



64 McIntyre Street • Nairn Centre, Ontario • P0M 2L0 ☎ 705-869-4232 📠 705-869-5248
Established: March 7, 1896 Office of the Clerk Treasurer, CAO E-mail: belindaketchabaw@nairncentre.ca

July 17, 2025

The Honourable Doug Ford, Premier of Ontario
Premier's Office, Room 281
Legislative Building, Queen's Park
Toronto, ON M7A 1A1
Sent via email: premier@ontario.ca

The Honourable Stephen Lecce, Minister of Energy and Mines
College Park, 5th Floor, 777 Bay Street
Toronto, ON M7A 2J3
Sent via email : stephen.lecce@pc.ola.org and MinisterEnergy@ontario.ca

The Honourable Prabmeet Singh Sarkaria, Minister of Transportation
5th Floor, 777 Bay Street
Toronto, ON M7A 2J3
Sent via email: mtinfo@ontario.ca and prabmeetsarkaria@pc.ola.org

The Honourable Todd J. McCarthy, Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks
5th Floor, 777 Bay Street
Toronto, ON M7A 2J3
Sent via email: todd.mccarthy@pc.ola.org and minister.mnrf@ontario.ca

Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission
280 Slater Street, P.O. Box 1046, Station B
Ottawa, ON K1P 5S9
Sent via email: cnsccsn@ccsn.gc.ca and patrick.burton@cnsccsn.gc.ca

RE: Opposition to the Transportation and Disposal of Niobium Tailings at the Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area

Please be advised that the Council of the Township of Nairn and Hyman has passed a formal resolution opposing the proposed transport and disposal of approximately 18,600 cubic metres of niobium mine tailings from the Nova Beaucage Mine and associated MTO gravel pit to the Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area (ALTEMA), located within our municipal boundaries.

This resolution follows the independent review by Hutchinson Environmental Sciences Ltd. conducted on behalf of the Township of the technical documents submitted by the Ministry of Energy and Mines and the Ministry of Transportation, including the Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment (HHERA)

and the Conceptual Site Model (CSM). The findings of Hutchinson's review have raised significant concerns regarding the sufficiency of the risk assessment, groundwater and surface water monitoring, leachability modeling, baseline data gaps, and long-term containment and environmental management plans. These issues pose unacceptable risks to public health, the surrounding watershed, and the long-term environmental integrity of our region.

Further, it has come to the Township's attention that the Ministry of Transportation has transported a portion of the niobium tailings to Clean Harbors, a licensed hazardous waste treatment facility near Sarnia. This action raises a serious question as to why all the material is not being disposed of through the same secure and regulated channel, instead of being placed at an aging tailings management site adjacent to sensitive ecosystems and communities.

The Township of Nairn and Hyman also wishes to acknowledge and support the position of the United Chiefs and Councils of Mnidoo Mnising (UCCMM), who have issued a letter voicing their firm opposition to this project. Their concerns are rooted not only in environmental impact, but also in the Ministry's failure to conduct meaningful consultation with the impacted UCCMM First Nations, whose traditional territory includes the Agnew Lake area. Their letter is attached for your review and inclusion in the public record.

This resolution passed at the Council Meeting of the Township of Nairn and Hyman on July 14, 2025, calls upon your government and relevant ministries to halt any further actions related to the transportation of this hazardous product to the ALTMA site.

The resolution reads as follows:

RESOLUTION # 2025-8-152

DATED: July 14, 2025

MOVED BY: Wayne Austin

SECONDED BY: Karen Richter

WHEREAS the Ministry of Energy and Mines and Ministry of Transportation has proposed the transportation and placement of approximately 18,600 cubic metres of niobium mine tailings from the Nova Beaucage Mine and associated MTO gravel pit to the Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area, located within the Township of Nairn and Hyman;

AND WHEREAS the Ministry has submitted technical documentation, including a Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment (HHERA) and Conceptual Site Model (CSM), which have been independently reviewed by Hutchinson Environmental Sciences Ltd. on behalf of the Township;

AND WHEREAS Hutchinson Environmental Sciences Ltd. report raises serious concerns regarding the adequacy of risk modeling, leachability assessments, hydrogeological characterization, biological monitoring, and long-term containment of radionuclides and toxic metals;

AND WHEREAS the Township has recently learned that the Ministry of Transportation intends to transport an existing stockpile of niobium tailings to Clean Harbors, a licensed hazardous waste treatment facility in Sarnia, Ontario, raising the question as to why all of the niobium tailings are not being managed in the same manner;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the Township of Nairn and Hyman formally opposes the transportation or placement of niobium tailings at the Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area;

AND FURTHER THAT this resolution be forwarded to the Honourable Doug Ford, Premier of Ontario; the Honourable Stephen Lecce, the Minister of Energy and Mines; the Honourable Prabmeet Singh Sarkaria, the Minister of Transportation; the Honourable Todd J. McCarthy, the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks; the Ontario Ombudsman; the Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission; MP Jim Belanger; MPP Bill Rosenberg; MPP France Gelinas; the Association of Ontario Municipalities and all Ontario Municipalities.

CARRIED

We respectfully request your immediate attention to this matter and urge the Province of Ontario to prioritize the protection of our community's health, safety, and environmental integrity.

For more information regarding this matter, please contact our municipal office by email at belindaketchabaw@nairncentre.ca or by phone at (705) 869-4232.

Sincerely,

Belinda Ketchabaw
CAO Clerk Treasurer
Township of Nairn and Hyman
64 McIntyre Street,
Nairn Centre, ON P0M 2L0

Attachments: UCCMM Letter – Agnew Lake Tailings Management, Chief Patsy Corbiere, July 14, 2025

Cc:

Chief Patsy Corbiere and the Aundeck Omni Kaning First Nation Council Members
The United Chiefs and Council of Mniidoo Mnising
Ontario Ombudsman
Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission
Canadian Environmental Law Association
MP Jim Belanger
MPP Bill Rosenberg
MPP France Gelinas
Association of Ontario Municipalities
All Ontario Municipalities
Maria Magdalene Healy, Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission
Adam Levine, Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission
Marc Stewart, Ministry of Energy and Mines
Rob Schryburt, Ministry of Energy and Mines
Eric Cobb, Ministry of Energy and Mines
Kristin Franks, Ministry of Transportation
Andrew Healy, Ministry of Transportation



UNITED CHIEFS and COUNCILS OF MNIDOO MNISING

July 14, 2025

Hon. George Pirie
Minister of Mines
minister.mines@ontario.ca

Hon. Prabmeet Sarkaria
Minister of Transportation
minister.mto@ontario.ca

Adam Levine Team Leader,
Indigenous Consultation and Participant Funding Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission
adam.levine@cnsccsn.gc.ca

Re: Lack of First Nations engagement regarding Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area

We are writing to express our serious concerns about the lack of engagement with the impacted UCCMM First Nations regarding the ongoing monitoring and management of the Agnew Lake Tailings Management Area, including but not limited to the decision in 2020 to expand the scope of the existing licence to allow for the depositing of large quantities of radioactive material from the former Beaucage Mine (WNSL-W5-3102.01/2025), as well as the proposed renewal of the licence for the site.

In the fall of last year UCCMM raised serious concerns with you and your staff about depositing large quantities of radioactive material at the site and the impacts of this on the UCCMM First Nations' rights, interests and well-being.

The Tailings Management Area is in close proximity to areas actively used for the exercise of our treaty protected s. 35 rights, including fishing and trapping. Despite this, there appears to have been no adequate engagement with our First Nations either about the decision to add more radioactive site to the Tailings Area, or about ongoing monitoring and management of the Tailings Area.

After a meeting with UCCMM last fall we were promised more detailed information about the project to add new radioactive materials to the site and the management of the site. While we have received some information from CNSC, we have received no further information or communication from Ontario. While we are aware of Ontario's communications with Whitefish River First Nation, as far as we are aware, the detailed information promised to WRFN by Ontario in December of 2024 was also never provided. In any event, WRFN is not the only UCCMM First Nation impacted, a point that was made clear in our meeting with Ontario officials last fall. Despite

this, UCCMM was not even notified directly by Ontario about its further plans to move ahead with this project.

It is entirely contrary to the Honour of the Crown and the Crown's obligation for the Crown to move ahead with plans that will likely have a significant negative impact on the UCCMM First Nations where the Crown has repeatedly failed to be forthcoming with its promises to provide information.

UCCMM must have adequate information, as well as time and resources to review that information to assess the level of impact on our rights, and what alternatives are available.

Please confirm that Ontario will pause any further plans to move ahead with a renewal or to move any additional radioactive material to the site until appropriate consultation and accommodation – including the provision of adequate data – is completed.

Please contact Saul Bomberly sbomberly@uccmm.ca at the Tribal Council to arrange a meeting with UCCMM and provide him the relevant information immediately.

Chief Patsy Corbiere
Tribal Chair

cc. Eric Cobb, MINES
Marc Stewart, MINES
UCCMM First Nations Chief and Councils
Township of Nairn and Hyman